

Scottish Health Impact Assessment Network Meeting Notes
Elphinstone House, Glasgow
10.30 to 1.30pm, Thursday 11th June 2009

Present

Margaret Douglas (Chair), NHS Lothian; Martin Higgins, NHS Lothian/Network Coordinator; Debbie Sigerson, NHS Health Scotland; Susie Palmer, Glasgow City Council; Hilary Thomson, MRC SPHS Unit, Glasgow; Council; Eive Currie, Glasgow City Clare Campbell, Fife Council; Jo Walmsley, Culture Sport Glasgow; Janice Gray, Living Streets; Ea O'Neill, Greenspace Scotland; Christine Tait, Glasgow CHCP; Brian Miller, Institute of Occupational Medicine

Apologies

Russell Jones, GCPH; Julie Truman, NHS GG&C; Ruth Kendall, NHS GG&C; Jo Winterbottom, Glasgow City Council; Duncan Booker, Glasgow City Council; Anne Scoular, NHS Greater Glasgow And Clyde; Linda Middlemist, West Lothian Council; Karen McGuigan, NHS Lanarkshire; Lesley Armitage, NHS Lanarkshire; Stuart Tait, Glasgow and Clyde Valley Structure Plan team; Eilidh Johnston, Greenspace Scotland; Alastair Mathers, Midlothian Council; Michelle Dowling, South Lanarkshire Council; Andrew Hale, North Ayrshire Council; Emma O'Keefe, North Lanarkshire CHP; Kathleen Fulton, NHS Tayside

1. Minutes of meeting 4^h December 2008

These were agreed as a true record

2. Matters arising

- *Conferences:* Martin confirmed that the 2010 International HIA Conference will take place in Portugal. Margaret said that the International Association of Impact Assessment in 2010 will be in Geneva, Switzerland.
- *Future HIA Guides:* Margaret and Hilary have agreed in principle that the HIA and Housing interventions guide will be updated in 2010. Hilary has completed a new systematic review on health and housing and housing regeneration issues. She says there is more evidence than before so the guide should be even more comprehensive. Brian asked whether there was much consideration of internal combustion sources (open fires, stoves) and health in the guide.

Action: Hilary and Brian agreed to share the draft of the review with Sean Semple at IOM.

Margaret also asked for input from network members about the types of questions and issues that the Guide should cover.

Action: Martin to circulate an email requesting input about key issues to be covered in the guide

Christine pointed out that housing issues need to be seen in the context of neighbourhoods. Specifically she raised the issue of the link between open space and health. There was a discussion about open space, greenspace and urban design. It was agreed that this would be a good topic for future guides.

Martin explained that he had discussed potential for some work on health impact and alcohol and alcohol licensing with Rona Dougall at NHS Greater

Glasgow and Clyde who has completed a literature review on the topic. It has been agreed that Martin, Rona and Jo Winterbottom will continue to investigate this topic – current workloads may delay this.

Etive suggested considering health issues and HMO licensing as a topic worthy of interest too. It was suggested that this might also be covered under health impact and housing.

Margaret explained that she had completed a report on HIA and social enterprises with John Boswall. It shows how HIA can be applied in a different setting. The report will be posted on the SHIAN website.

- *Website:* The website (<http://www.healthscotland.com/resources/networks/shian.aspx>) has been comprehensively updated. There will be new 'How to' guides posted as soon as some technical problems have been resolved. The group agreed that the network emailing list should not be used to publicise the wide range of HIA training courses on offer; perhaps better to put links on the website instead.
- *Training:* Potential training was discussed in addition to the e-learning course. Etive noted that some people with some knowledge of HIA may require top-up training. In response to Christine's query about accreditation of the e-learning course, Margaret explained that this had been investigated and seemed too burdensome given resources available within the network. It was agreed that Martin would send an email to the network seeking interest in a training cohort. Various training might be offered: a cohort or learning set using the HIA-e-learning course; one day intro to HIA courses using the HIA e-learning; and, more detailed HIA training. Debbie noted that it should be possible to find out how many people had accessed the e-learning course, which might inform future activity.
Action: Martin to email the network to canvass interest in training. Debbie to assess current use of the HIA e-learning course.

3. Commonwealth Games HIA

Since December 2008, there has been lots of work analysing data from community surveys and participation events. Five community feedback events were also arranged. This information has been fed into the final report alongside the literature review and other sources of information.

Susie explained that the draft final report has been circulated both to the Legacy Committee and the HIA steering group. The report has recommendations based on 13 themes. Infrastructure, civic pride, the economy and housing and the environment are most prominent. It seems likely that the HIA recommendations will be a major part of the Glasgow 2014 Legacy Group Action Plan which is scheduled for publication in September. Glasgow CC are in discussion with Glasgow Centre for Population Health and NHS GG&C about monitoring and evaluation. A separate process evaluation of the HIA is being conducted by SCDC.

4. Planning

Martin updated the group on the new planning system. Comments on the second part of the new Scottish Planning Policy (SPP) document are due on 24 June. The new SPP contains much less detail than the range of policies it will replace. There is a focus on delegating decision-making to local authorities, speeding up the planning

system and encouraging community consultation. Etive noted that there is very little guidance for planners in the new documents. This is intended to encourage creativity in planning decision but there is concern that it may mean inconsistent decision-making. Janice commented on concerns that health and health related issues such as active travel may well be sidelined in this process.

Action: Martin to draft a response to the SPP consultation seeking input from Janice and Etive.

Etive commented that the RTPI health and planning document seemed to demonstrate a poor understanding of key issues. It is hoped that the RTPI Scotland document is an improvement.

Action: Martin to check with Caroline Brown the status of the RTPI documents.

5. Equally Well

Etive summarised the Glasgow planning and health project which she is leading. It will focus on projects in the East End and north of the city with a view to further integration of health issues into planning using a) the Healthy Sustainable Neighbourhoods Model, and b) ways of engaging with partners and communities eg., the private sector in the East End.

Etive and Tim Mitchell have met with Harry Burns (Chief Medical Officer) and he has asked them to explore the qualitative evidence base for healthy places in more detail. In particular, this means gathering evidence from around Scotland of healthy placemaking. It is hoped that one of the main outcomes of the project will be Placemaking Design Guides.

At present, the Healthy Sustainable Neighbourhoods Model is based around nine sections: Employment and Training; Health and Wellbeing; Climate; Lifelong learning; People; Transport; Green Engineering; Leisure and Recreation; and Housing Diversity. It is hoped that SHIAN members can provide assistance to the project, especially when sections of the model are being populated with evidence.

6. HIA of National Cycle Network 7

Martin explained that this project has been developed since the last meeting when greenspace Scotland indicated that there was some funding available to support some HIAs that made use of the new HIA and Greenspace Guide. This project emerged after a call for proposals circulated by SHIAN and greenspace Scotland.

NCN 7 runs through North Ayrshire and there is a feasibility plan being developed to update the route between Kilwinning and Dalry, a stretch of approximately 10km. This is an area of quite high deprivation. The current NCN7 travels mostly on-road. Consultants have been hired to devise a new route. The HIA is feeding into this proposal. The new plan sees the route go off-road. If this route is agreed, it can be identified and protected in the new Local Plan. Funding for the project can then be pursued. Given the economic downturn, money is unlikely to be available to complete the new route. But it is hoped that sections of a revised route can be opened.

There has been an HIA screening session to help scope the parameters for the rapid appraisal. There was also a dedicated health impacts public consultation exercise in Kilbirnie which complemented a previous public consultation about the new route during which consultees were asked to comment on potential health impacts. The final

report is being drafted by Eilidh Johnston at greenspace Scotland with input from Martin Higgins and Louise Kirk at North Ayrshire Council.

Janice suggested that the Smarter Choices project in Dundee might provide some helpful pointers about good practice. Debbie suggested that Health Scotland's logic modelling about greenspace and health (done in Dundee and Glasgow in conjunction with greenspace Scotland) might also be useful.

7. Integrated impact assessment

Margaret reported that she is working in Scottish Government part time on the development of integrated impact assessment as recommended in Equally Well.

Debbie made a presentation on a proposed scoping study on IIA across Scotland. The first stage of the project will try to ascertain current activity across local authorities and health boards. This will involve use of surveymonkey to capture data.

There may then be some detailed work looking at Impact assessment documentation, supplemented by interviews and identification of case studies.

There was a brief discussion about whether case studies or examples are what is required from stage two of the project. There was also some discussion about the difference between screening and full assessment. All agreed that lessons learned in places such as Fife, where IIA exists already, will be key. Debbie asked for volunteers to help pilot the survey – Clare and Christine agreed to help out.

8. MWIA

Martin confirmed that he had a complete draft of a paper reflecting on the three comparative HIAs and MWIAs done in Scotland during 2008. As this had not been agreed by other members of the team doing the assessments, the paper has not yet been circulated. But key suggestions include:

- The differences between HIA and MWIA are small. The greater emphasis on mental wellbeing in MWIA highlights limitations about coverage of this subject in HIA. But improving coverage of mental wellbeing within HIAs should not be impossible.
- People were generally very positive about the MWIA as a means of highlighting and discussing mental wellbeing issues. The importance of truly participatory and collaborative groupwork should not be underestimated.
- The use of a desktop screening tool would quickly identify those topics where MWIA would be most valuable, or those where another type of Impact Assessment would be more relevant. It is important that this is just a screening tool however. There has been much written about integrated impact assessment but this is not what is suggested or required in this instance.
- It would also make sense to develop capacity within local authorities/health boards to support MWIA in much the same way as this would be desirable for HIA. MWIA may attract a wider range of staff because of its relevance to mental health as well as public health. There may be some value in offering MWIA training in conjunction with HIA training to build this capacity.

Group members noted that the development of plans relating to Towards a Mentally Flourishing Scotland is ongoing. It is notable that thinking and language about mental wellbeing is central to TAMFS.

Action: Martin to update and circulate final report once agreed by group.

9. SEA and health

Margaret presented findings of her review of a selection of SEAs that were submitted to the SEA Gateway in 2007. (See attached presentation.) The review showed that a wide range of health impacts were considered but coverage was very inconsistent. SEAs did not consider differential impacts and the health evidence used to assess impact was not clear from the reports.

The group discussed ways to include consistency of coverage of health impacts, including the potential for specific evidence-based reviews to be made available on topics commonly subjected to SEA.

10. Updates on current work

Brian described work he has done for the Health Protection Agency about quantification of mortality and morbidity attributable to air pollution. He is hoping to use this work in a Scottish context.

Etive mentioned that there is a move to include HIA within Town Centre Action Plans in Glasgow. The Easterhouse masterplan will have a HIA supplementing the EIA.

Martin and Margaret are involved in a HIA of a housing redevelopment proposal in Edinburgh which is linked to a government initiative called 21st Century Homes.

Jo is hoping to learn about HIA as a way to work with some of the arts organisations in Glasgow. Christine is hoping to utilise HIA as part of her team's work on health inequalities.

Clare explained that developing support and training for HIA in Fife is now essential. Proposals are with committees but progress is slow due to lack of commitment thus far from colleagues.

Janice outlined Living Street's forthcoming healthy environment project. Due to be published in July, it is a toolkit targeted at local authorities. It aims to help develop built environments which prioritise people and increase/improve walkability.

Debbie mentioned that a Project Manager for Better Places, Better Health will soon be recruited.

11. Date of Next Meeting

Thursday 3rd December 2009 at 10.30am, Conference Room, NHS Health Scotland, 2nd Floor, Thistle House, 91 Haymarket Terrace, Edinburgh EH12 5HE